Broskie-Macaulay Amplifier

4 February 2005



Something about Jeff Macaulay's amplifier always troubled me—beyond the claims of single-ended class-A operation. That something lies in an asymmetry in output devices' transfer curves; this is a mismatch that cannot be eradicated with tightly matched output devices, as the unevenness is imposed externally to the devices. In essence, the bottom output device benefits from the 1-ohm resistor at its emitter/source/cathode, as it provides local degeneration (feedback), straightening the device's transfer curve. In contrast, the top output device is only burdened by the 1-ohm resistor at its collector/drain/plate, as it offers no useful degeneration and only steals valuable B+ voltage from the output device. Local degeneration?

I have been told that at the 2004 European Triode Festival (ETF and, no, I didn't attend) they held a shoot out between cathode-bias devices: a resistor, a bypassed resistor, an LED, a battery... After a suspense-building pause, the winner was the unbypassed cathode resistor. (Although I agree with the results and I would have been truly surprised if they were otherwise, I would like to know how the test was setup, as differing gains and output impedances could easily pollute the test's cleanliness.) Really, the only surprise was that such a result was surprising for so many.

Using a tube as an example, an unbypassed cathode resistor lowers the grounded-cathode amplifier's gain and distortion, but raises its output impedance. Why does the distortion go down? The resistor is the same current path as the plate resistor, so it will see all the variation in current flow that the plate resistor sees, which means that the input signal will be imprinted across this resistor (in phase with the input signal). Thus, if a 100k-plate resistor develops an output signal of 10 volts, then a 1k-cathode resistor will develop a signal of 0.1 volts. The signal strength at the cathode can be found from this formula:

Ark = muRk / [Ra + rp + (mu + 1)Rk]

which looks like the formula for the gain at the plate:

Only \$19.95 to keep track of your tube and part collection

TCJ My-Stock DB



		NUMBER OF TAXABLE							- 313	20
		* * * **	ne press	Serve Statut	Service Rental Name					pad
	_	-	- has	Carella	Resider	1 Nation	Take	Tube	Tube .	
1	A Country of Country o	100	100	100.0	1 photo	141	344	-96,7	48.7	
		COLUMN TWO IS NOT	-	1014	But	804	Argene	Column 1	Totana .	
3.				40.000	1.0	104	(reals	10.0	100	
51		-	Per-	Automotive	Pres	479	104	144	1.44	
÷	1000	972 I	(and a	10m	10hu	Demois Fee Bund	Gartres Fas hand	from the st	Just Tribupat	
1	-	-	Tests facts	0.01008.000	84.	55	88	848	100	
1			Paged	Una trapilitar	Generation	to Popul	Peoplytune http:	read/ors trythe	In Property	
H		Contract of Contract	nachrit	(D. F	14	Apr.	18	N		
		200	the the		- 10	1				
	1000	COMPANY.	Contraction.	in the second	ine .	044	408	ALC N	HOR	
		and the second	100	81.75	81.00	894.04	846.04	8.0	8.0	
		1.0	-	81.75	86.55	101.04	N 14	9.06	810	
ī.	100	0	Test late	854.85	825.85	1010	8.00.00	810.00	80.05	
			Sel.e	100	100	Tab	Tang.	And a	100	
	COLUMN A	-	Location.	Ba I	Bart.	Baserard	Report	841	Samp	
1	nie image			Lood soundry, sumarks bet will cold been	e dan munaer salarina	Paulti & Millioner (M	Yang in sufficient too	111 halo unot	Por healthing and	
	Section 1	Rest R.								
a.	Danken imm	Part Name	-	Tute	Ne	Tale	Take	Take	Tute	
5			10.00	40.4	10.7	10,7	46.7	1947	1941	
			-	Arigent	Tangita	(aforeiter	bingen .	Rational	Arigen	
			-	Test	Test	Tech	10.0	Teste	Teste	
			10.0	875.00	0.04	504	204	1/1.00	3.75.55	
			-	Fee Bard	own for faces	Paytene	Tax Ball	free feet	Dag Red	
			Same and	14.	14.	M.	85	14	14	
			Pres.	Prove street	to Property	In/road	No.Project	Pros Pages	Proto-Pages	
			Transford Barrier	11	-		60			
			in the second	1	11	1				
			in the second	1404	1408	408	408	80.0	1408	
			100.0	10.00	810.00	81.04	P0.00	840.00	10.00	
			-	All all	84.45	81.04	N 14	8.00	110	
			The second	17.0	100.00	10.00	101.0	ACC. IN	8798.00	
			-	Tate	Tan.	Tab	Tab	And a	1000	
l			1000	Baugest	Ball	Buil	Ball.	Bar I	Basi.	
			-	hand a	out interest souther	Name And Post Owned	Selection for most	Related Lemontation	Taxa and Date	
						halos	had a diff range			l
	and the local division of	and a state of the state	and a local division of the local division o							
-	and the second second	ALC: NOT THE OWNER.								

	NU Ny Brock							. (0	×
	ی ا	10 C F H 🕇	1Del	iete Be-index	5ame 0.58 pF	\$ee	on Setty Name	• • Help Bi	out
1	4. Pet Tree	Capacitor	T.	Part Type	Kame	Quantity	Brand	Vendor	- 8
18		1547 880		 Capacitor 	0.00 pt	4	viine	Elley	
2	344			Resistor	1 ohm	25	Shale.	EBey	
	prend	Wima	•	Tyte	243	3	REA	Electronic Fiele Warket	
18	274	480 VDC		Tyle	5484	7	Angeres	Electronic Fiele Married	
12	Division in the second s	Polypropylana		Tyle	68.7	4	Sphara	Even Vent	
2		inment.	-	7,04	6817	4	Sylvaria	Joe's TV Repair	
13	Xeron Thurson	-	2,04	4048	3	Anperes	Fee Tartel		
1÷	Vendor Part (D	Part B CAP-018A-1.5-400 Prend Line Amplifier		1.04	45.7	11	Tung dat	Joe's TV Repair	
8	Print			1,04	40.7	3	Deforestion	Fealtand	
18	Desired Red F.	012		7,08	49.7	15	Sylvana	Feeliatet	
	righter and		_	Type	12ATP	22	National	Swep Next	
8	Cuartery.	2	•	1/04	11ATE	11	Anperex	Sivep West	
2	Congition	New		Resistor	178-atm	- 6	Valay	Electronic Fiele Harriet	
5	Valig per lien	6.50		Resider	4000 ohm	10	Value	Parts Connellion	
6	Real and Ann	4.50		Tyle	5647	5	Turp-Bel	Doubp Vent	
			-	Tute	METHA	4	98	Antique Decenno Suppl	w
Ξ	Due Anne	\$13.00	•	7,08	5694	3	RCA	Doubp Meet	
	Status	Keep		1.04	EL04	8	Mulard	Smap Next	
3	Shorter	Box 3	•	Suchet	PCB Socket	100	,	Elley	
Hite Coll Options	Comments	Not bad sounding	ue.						
	Deep of 148	Transford on a 42 King of		JAN WE					
1044	# 150mg # 245	TOTAL FORM # \$2,524.3	1 I I	100 EC + F					

A = -muRa / [Ra + rp + (mu + 1)Rk]

If this signal at the cathode exactly equaled the input signal in all but amplitude, then the distortion would vanish from the plate, as the tube would have to have produced zero distortion to create such equality. Real tubes do distort and that distortion is present on the unbypassed cathode resistor. This distortion is in voltage anti-phase with the input signal. For example, if the cathode voltage is too low compared to the grid's voltage, the tube will increase its conduction, which will lift the cathode voltage. On the other hand, if the cathode voltage is too high compared to the grid's voltage, the tube will decrease its conduction, which will drop the cathode voltage. In other words, feedback. The larger the cathode resistor's value, the more feedback.

Below is a graph of a power MOSFET with and without a source resistor (1 ohm). Note how much transconductance (gm) was lost (hold a ruler to the screen) and how much more linear the transfer curve is. The unbypassed resistor produced a good amount of feedback, but at the cost of gm.





A triode's decrease in gm because of an unbypassed cathode resistor is: gm' = mu / (rp + [mu + 1]Rk)

Wait a minute

You mean to tell me that the greatest minds (and ears) in tube world voted for the circuit with the most feedback? It is almost as if country-western singers were polled and the result was that most found sobriety preferable to







TCJ My-Stock DB helps you know just what you have, what it looks like, where it is, what it will be used for, and what it's worth. *TCJ My-Stock DB* helps you to keep track of your heap of electronic parts. More details.

Version 2 Improvements

List all of your parts in one DB. Add part Images. One-click web searches for information. Vertical and horizontal grids.* Create reports as PDFs.* Graphs added 2D/3D: pie & bar.* More powerful DB search. Help system added. Editable drop-down lists for location, projects, brands, styles, vendors and more.

*User definable

drunkenness. Why the surprise? The only problem with distortion is that it deforms the signal, sullying purity and mucking clarity.

Returning to the Macaulay circuit, if we move the sense resistor from the top device's collector/drain/plate to its emitter/source/cathode, what would result? Well, the output device's transconductance would decrease along with its nonlinearity, so the OpAmp will have to swing slightly more output voltage to compensate, which in the solid-state version is not that big a liability. Additionally, the top output device is better protected from a shorted output, as the 1-ohm resistor limits the maximum current flow through the device. Most importantly, the top and bottom output devices' transfer curves would match eachother. Below is the revised circuit:



In breif, the transistors have been swapped out with MOSFETs; the idle current is now a healthy 1A; the AD823 OpAmp works particularly well in this application, as it can swing to within 0.5V of its rail voltages; the input coupling capacitor both limits the low-frequency amplification and allows full DC feedback to maintain a low DC offset at the output (yes, the amplifier inverts the phase, but the loudspeaker leads can be reversed); the amplifier can be rewired for no phase inversion, but the capacitor cannot be eliminated, as it is needed to prevent high DC offsets at the output.

All in all a good little amplifier, perfect for annoying audiophiles who like to spend lots more money. It only puts out 7 watts, but then many 300B SE amplifiers only put out 7 watts. Of course, the 300B is likely to sound more powerful than this amplifier, as its clipping can never be as sharp as this amplifier's, as a transformer-based amplifier can never accept as much negative feedback because of the phase shifts through the transformer.

Still, if I owned a \$3,000 300B amplifier I would be afraid to put it up against this amplifier, as its distortion products have a distinct single-ended quality to them, as shown below. Note the second and third are about all there is and note how low they are relative to the fundamental. If reality were only half as good as these SPICE simulation, we would still have an excellent amplifier.

Download or CD ROM Windows 95/98/Me/NT/2000/XP

For more information, please visit:

www.glass-ware.com

To purchase , please visit our Yahoo Store: http://store.yahoo.com/glassware



Further enhancements

I cannot let a schematic sit five minutes before wanting to improve it. In this case, the power supply is probably the weakest link, as it is not regulated. Regulating the power supply is one possibility, but an easier, less expensive tact is to regulate only the OpAmp's power supply. However, we cannot afford to lose a precious volt of output swing from the OpAmps and cascading a regulator from the existing power supply will lose at least 3-volts potential swing, because of the voltage drop across the regulator.



This is a problem all follower-based output stages face: the driver circuit needs to work with a greater B+ voltage than the output stage, as it must swing a greater output-voltage swing than the output stage, particularily with a MOSFET output stage. Yet, most designers are loath to add a second power transformer. Instead, they will add a series resistor and decoupling capacitor and hope that too much voltage isn't lost; or, they may only place a rectifier in series with the existing power supply, so that when the output stage force the rail voltage to collapse, the driver stage and input stage's power supply capacitors will not discharge into the main power supply. The better solution is to add full-wave voltage doublers to each rail, creating new rail at twice the power supply's nominal voltage. These new rails can then be passively or actively smoothed. Below is a such a voltage-doubled power supply circuit.





7 watts?

Why not build a 30 or 100 watt version? Theoretically such an amplifier is possible, but finding suitable OpAmps to drive it is challenging. In spite of there being thousands of OpAmps, only a few sound all that good and very few can handle 50-volt rails, which a 100W amplifier would require. I know that Apex make high-voltage OpAmps, but I have no practical experience with them. If you have a suggested OpAmp, please send it in.

//JRB

< Back	www.tubecad.com	Copyright © 1999-2005	GlassWare	All Rights Reserved	Next >
--------	-----------------	------------------------------	-----------	---------------------	--------